

7TH EDITION

Biomedical ETHICS

DAVID DEGRAZIA

THOMAS A. MAPPES

JEFFREY BRAND-BALLARD

CONTENTS

Preface XVII

CHAPTER 1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION 1

THE NATURE OF BIOMEDICAL ETHICS 1

RECENTLY DOMINANT ETHICAL THEORIES 4

The Critical Assessment of Competing Ethical Theories 5

Consequentialist Versus Deontological Theories 6

Act-Utilitarianism 7

Rule-Utilitarianism 13

Kantian Deontology 17

W. D. Ross's Theory of Prima Facie Duties 23

THE PRINCIPLES OF BIOMEDICAL ETHICS 26

ALTERNATIVE DIRECTIONS AND METHODS 27

Virtue Ethics 28

The Ethics of Care and Feminist Ethics 30

Casuistry: Case-Based Reasoning in Historical Context 33

Reflective Equilibrium and Appeals to Coherence 36

CONFRONTING ETHICAL RELATIVISM 38

FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS AND PRINCIPLES 40

Autonomy 41

Liberty-Limiting Principles 46

Paternalism 48

NOTES 51

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 54

APPENDIX: SELECTED REFERENCE SOURCES

IN BIOMEDICAL ETHICS 56

Print Resources 56

Web Resources 56

CHAPTER 2 THE PROFESSIONAL-PATIENT RELATIONSHIP 58

INTRODUCTION 58

Physicians' Obligations and Virtues	58
Paternalism and Respect for Autonomy	59
The Role and Responsibilities of Nurses	61
Truth-Telling	63
Confidentiality and Conflicting Obligations	64
Informed Consent	66
The Practice of Medicine in a Multicultural Society	68

NOTES 69

PHYSICIANS' OBLIGATIONS AND VIRTUES 69

<i>The Hippocratic Oath</i>	69
Edmund D. Pellegrino, <i>The Virtuous Physician and the Ethics of Medicine</i>	70

PHYSICIAN-PATIENT MODELS AND PATIENT AUTONOMY 74

James F. Childress and Mark Siegler, <i>Metaphors and Models of Doctor-Patient Relationships: Their Implications for Autonomy</i>	75
Terrence F. Ackerman, <i>Why Doctors Should Intervene</i>	83

THE ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF NURSES 88

Lisa H. Newton, <i>In Defense of the Traditional Nurse</i>	88
Helga Kuhse, <i>Advocacy or Subsistence for the Sake of Patients?</i>	95

TRUTH-TELLING AND CONFIDENTIALITY 103

Roger Higgs, <i>On Telling Patients the Truth</i>	103
Justice Mathew O. Tobriner, <i>Majority Opinion in Tarasoff v. Regents of the University of California</i>	109
Justice William P. Clark, <i>Dissenting Opinion in Tarasoff v. Regents of the University of California</i>	113
<i>Please Don't Tell: A Case About HIV and Confidentiality</i> (with commentaries by Leonard Fleck and Marcia Angell)	116

INFORMED CONSENT 120

President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, <i>The Values Underlying Informed Consent</i>	120
Howard Brody, <i>Transparency: Informed Consent in Primary Care</i>	126

THE PRACTICE OF MEDICINE IN A MULTICULTURAL CONTEXT 132

Ruth Macklin, <i>Ethical Relativism in a Multicultural Society</i>	132
--	-----

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 141

CHAPTER 3 CONTESTED THERAPIES AND BIOMEDICAL ENHANCEMENT 144

INTRODUCTION 144

Contested Therapies	146
Biomedical Enhancements	150

NOTES 154

CONTESTED THERAPIES 155

- Robert A. Crouch, *Letting the deaf be Deaf: Reconsidering the Use of Cochlear Implants* 155
- Bonnie Poitras Tucker, *Deaf Culture, Cochlear Implants, and Elective Disability* 162
- Sherri A. Groveman (Morris), *The Hanukkah Bush: Ethical Implications in the Clinical Management of Intersex* 168
- Lisa Abelow Hedley, *The Seduction of a Surgical Fix* 172
- Josephine Johnston, *Judging Octomom* 176
- Carl Elliott, *Amputees by Choice* 179

COSMETIC SURGERY 187

- Franklin G. Miller, Howard Brody, and Kevin C. Chung, *Cosmetic Surgery and the Internal Morality of Medicine* 187
- Margaret Olivia Little, *Cosmetic Surgery, Suspect Norms, and the Ethics of Complicity* 196

COSMETIC PSYCHOPHARMACOLOGY 205

- Peter D. Kramer, *Makeover* 205
- Carol Freedman, *Aspirin for the Mind? Some Ethical Worries about Psychopharmacology* 213
- David DeGrazia, *Prozac, Enhancement, and Self-Creation* 222

OTHER TYPES OF NEUROENHANCEMENT 230

- Claudia Mills, *One Pill Makes You Smarter: An Ethical Appraisal of the Rise of Ritalin* 230
- Martha J. Farah and Paul Root Wolpe, *Monitoring and Manipulating Brain Function: New Neuroscience Technologies and Their Ethical Implications* 235

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 241**CHAPTER 4 HUMAN AND ANIMAL RESEARCH 243****INTRODUCTION 243**

- Conceptual Issues 243
- The Justification of Research Using Human Subjects 244
- The Informed-Consent Requirement 246
- Proxy Consent for Research Subjects Incapable of Informed Consent 247
- Experimental Design and Research in Developing Countries 248
- Animal Research 251

NOTES 252**ETHICAL CODES 253**

- The Nuremberg Code* 253
- World Medical Association, *Declaration of Helsinki* 254
- Council for International Organizations of Medical Sciences, *International Guiding Principles for Biomedical Research Involving Animals* 258

EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN AND RANDOMIZED CLINICAL TRIALS 260

- Samuel Hellman and Deborah S. Hellman, *Of Mice but Not Men: Problems of the Randomized Clinical Trial* 260
- Don Marquis, *How to Resolve an Ethical Dilemma Concerning Randomized Clinical Trials* 264

- Paul Litton and Franklin G. Miller, *A Normative Justification for Distinguishing the Ethics of Clinical Research from the Ethics of Medical Care* 268

CLINICAL TRIALS IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES 278

- Leonard H. Glantz, George J. Annas, Michael A. Grodin, and Wendy K. Mariner, *Research in Developing Countries: Taking Benefit Seriously* 278
- Baruch Brody, *Ethical Issues in Clinical Trials in Developing Countries* 284
- Participants in the 2001 Conference on Ethical Aspects of Research in Developing Countries, *Fair Benefits for Research in Developing Countries* 288

ANIMAL RESEARCH 292

- Carl Cohen, *The Case for the Use of Animals in Biomedical Research* 292
- Edwin Converse Hettinger, *The Responsible Use of Animals in Biomedical Research* 299
- David DeGrazia, *On the Ethics of Animal Research* 305

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 313

CHAPTER 5 DEATH AND DECISIONS REGARDING LIFE-SUSTAINING TREATMENT 316

INTRODUCTION 316

- The Definition and Determination of Death 316
- Competent Adults and the Refusal of Life-Sustaining Treatment 318
- DNR Orders and Medical Futility 319
- Advance Directives and Treatment Decisions for Incompetent Adults 320

NOTES 321

THE DEFINITION AND DETERMINATION OF DEATH 322

- James L. Bernat, *The Whole-Brain Concept of Death Remains Optimal Public Policy* 322
- Jeff McMahan, *An Alternative to Brain Death* 333
- Robert D. Truog and Franklin G. Miller, *The Dead Donor Rule and Organ Transplantation* 338

COMPETENT ADULTS AND THE REFUSAL OF LIFE-SUSTAINING TREATMENT 341

- Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs, American Medical Association, *Withholding and Withdrawing Life-Sustaining Treatment* 341
- Tia Powell and Bruce Lowenstein, *Refusing Life-Sustaining Treatment After Catastrophic Injury: Ethical Implications* 343
- Vicki Michel, *Suicide by Persons with Disabilities Disguised as the Refusal of Life-Sustaining Treatment* 348

DNR ORDERS AND MEDICAL FUTILITY 354

- Tom Tomlinson and Howard Brody, *Ethics and Communication in Do-Not-Resuscitate Orders* 354
- Mark R. Wicclair, *Medical Futility: A Conceptual and Ethical Analysis* 359

**ADVANCE DIRECTIVES AND TREATMENT DECISIONS FOR
INCOMPETENT ADULTS 363**

- Thomas A. Mappes, *Some Reflections on Advance Directives* 363
Rebecca Dresser, *The Conscious Incompetent Patient* 370

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 373

**CHAPTER 6 SUICIDE, PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE,
AND ACTIVE EUTHANASIA 376**

INTRODUCTION 376

- What Is Suicide? 376
The Morality of Suicide 378
The Morality of Active Euthanasia 378
The Supreme Court, Physician-Assisted Suicide, and
Terminal Sedation 380
Physician-Assisted Suicide, Active Euthanasia,
and Social Policy 381
Active Euthanasia of Infants and the Groningen Protocol in
the Netherlands 383

NOTES 384

THE MORALITY OF SUICIDE 385

- Immanuel Kant, *Suicide* 385
R. B. Brandt, *The Morality and Rationality of Suicide* 388

THE MORALITY OF ACTIVE EUTHANASIA 395

- James Rachels, *Active and Passive Euthanasia* 395
Daniel Callahan, *Killing and Allowing to Die* 399
Dan W. Brock, *Voluntary Active Euthanasia* 402

**THE SUPREME COURT, PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE,
AND TERMINAL SEDATION 404**

- Chief Justice William H. Rehnquist, *Opinion of the Court in
Washington v. Glucksberg* 404
Chief Justice William H. Rehnquist, *Opinion of the Court in
Vacco v. Quill* 410
Justice Sandra Day O'Connor, *Concurring Opinion in
Washington v. Glucksberg and Vacco v. Quill* 413
David Orentlicher, *The Supreme Court and Physician-Assisted Suicide:
Rejecting Assisted Suicide but Embracing Euthanasia* 414

**PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE, ACTIVE EUTHANASIA,
AND SOCIAL POLICY 418**

- Timothy E. Quill, Christine K. Cassel, and Diane E. Meier, *Care of the
Hopelessly Ill: Proposed Clinical Criteria for
Physician-Assisted Suicide* 418
The Oregon Death with Dignity Act 421
Franklin G. Miller, Timothy E. Quill, Howard Brody, John C. Fletcher,
Lawrence O. Gostin, and Diane E. Meier, *Regulating
Physician-Assisted Death* 426
John D. Arras, *On the Slippery Slope in the Empire State:
The New York State Task Force on Physician-Assisted Death* 432

- James L. Bernat, Bernard Gert, and R. Peter Mogielnicki, *Patient Refusal of Hydration and Nutrition: An Alternative to Physician-Assisted Suicide or Voluntary Active Euthanasia* 438

ACTIVE EUTHANASIA OF INFANTS AND THE GRONINGEN PROTOCOL IN THE NETHERLANDS 446

- Eduard Verhagen and Pieter J. J. Sauer, *The Groningen Protocol—Euthanasia in Severely Ill Newborns* 446

- Alexander A. Kon, *We Cannot Accurately Predict the Extent of an Infant's Future Suffering: The Groningen Protocol is Too Dangerous to Support* 450

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 453

CHAPTER 7 ABORTION AND EMBRYONIC STEM-CELL RESEARCH 456

INTRODUCTION 456

- Abortion: The Ethical Issue 456
Abortion and Social Policy 461
Embryonic Stem-Cell Research 463

NOTES 465

THE MORALITY OF ABORTION 466

- Pope John Paul II, *The Unspeakable Crime of Abortion* 466
Mary Anne Warren, *On the Moral and Legal Status of Abortion* 468
Don Marquis, *Why Abortion is Immoral* 475
Judith Jarvis Thomson, *A Defense of Abortion* 479
Margaret Olivia Little, *The Morality of Abortion* 487

ABORTION AND SOCIAL POLICY 492

- Justice Harry Blackmun, *Majority Opinion in Roe v. Wade* 492
George J. Annas, *The Supreme Court and Abortion Rights* 496

EMBRYONIC STEM-CELL RESEARCH 501

- National Institutes of Health, *Stem Cell Basics* 501
Jeff McMahan, *Killing Embryos for Stem Cell Research* 508
President's Council on Bioethics, *The Moral Case Against Cloning-for-Biomedical-Research* 513

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 520

CHAPTER 8 GENETICS AND HUMAN REPRODUCTION 523

INTRODUCTION 523

- Genetic Disease and the Language of Genetics 523
Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion 525
Morality and Reproductive Risk 526
Reproductive Technologies and the Treatment of Infertility 526
Reproductive Technologies: Ethical Concerns 528
Human Cloning 529
Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis 531
Genetic Engineering, Gene Therapy, and Enhancement 531

NOTES 532

**REPRODUCTIVE RISK, PRENATAL DIAGNOSIS,
AND SELECTIVE ABORTION 533**

Leon R. Kass, *Implications of Prenatal Diagnosis for the Human
Right to Life* 533

Laura M. Purdy, *Genetics and Reproductive Risk: Can Having Children
Be Immoral?* 538

REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES 544

Peter Singer, *IVF: The Simple Case* 544

Susan Sherwin, *Feminist Ethics and In Vitro Fertilization* 548

The New York State Task Force on Life and the Law, *Ethical Debates about
Infertility and its Treatment* 553

President's Council on Bioethics, *Assisted Reproduction* 560

GAMETE DONATION AND SURROGACY 565

Thomas H. Murray, *Families, the Marketplace, and Values: New Ways of
Making Babies* 565

Bonnie Steinbock, *Surrogate Motherhood as Prenatal Adoption* 573

HUMAN CLONING 577

Leon R. Kass, *Cloning of Human Beings* 577

Thomas H. Murray, *Even if it Worked, Cloning Wouldn't
Bring Her Back* 580

Robert Wachbroit, *Genetic Encores: The Ethics of Human Cloning* 583

PREIMPLANTATION GENETIC DIAGNOSIS 589

John A. Robertson, *Extending Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis: Medical
and Non-Medical Uses* 589

President's Council on Bioethics, *Selecting Embryos for
Desired Traits* 595

GENE THERAPY 598

Sophia Kolehmainen, *The Dangerous Promise of Gene Therapy* 598

LeRoy Walters and Julie Gage Palmer, *Germ-Line Gene Therapy* 602

GENETIC ENHANCEMENT 610

Michael J. Sandel, *Mastery and Gift* 610

Dan W. Brock, *Genetic Engineering* 615

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 620**CHAPTER 9 SOCIAL JUSTICE AND ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE 623****INTRODUCTION 623**

Justice, Rights, and Societal Obligations 626

Rationing, Managed Care, and Health-Care Reform in the
United States 629

Systems of Health-Care Delivery and Finance: Four International
Perspectives 630

Reform Proposals for the United States 635

NOTES 637**JUSTICE, RIGHTS, AND SOCIETAL OBLIGATIONS 638**

Allen Buchanan, *Justice: A Philosophical Review* 638

Kai Nielsen, *Autonomy, Equality and a Just Health-Care System* 649

INTERNATIONAL MODELS AND PERSPECTIVES	655
Raisa Berlin Deber, <i>Health Care Reform: Lessons from Canada</i>	655
Donald W. Light, <i>Universal Health Care: Lessons from the British Experience</i>	661
Christa Altenstetter, <i>Insights From Health Care in Germany</i>	667
Victor G. Rodwin and Claude Le Pen, <i>Health-Care Reform in France—the Birth of State-Led Managed Care</i>	672
REFORM PROPOSALS FOR THE UNITED STATES	675
Donald J. Palmisano, David W. Emmons, and Gregory D. Wozniak, <i>Expanding Insurance Coverage Through Tax Credits, Consumer Choice, and Market Enhancements: The American Medical Association Proposal for Health Insurance Reform</i>	675
David U. Himmelstein and Steffie Woolhandler, <i>National Health Insurance or Incremental Reform: Aim High, or at Our Feet?</i>	681
Ezekiel J. Emanuel, <i>The Problem with Single-Payer Plans</i>	686
Ezekiel J. Emanuel and Victor R. Fuchs, <i>Vouchsafe</i>	690
David DeGrazia, <i>Single Payer Meets Managed Competition: The Case for Public Funding and Private Delivery</i>	693
ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY	704
<i>Appendix: Case Studies</i>	707
<i>About the Contributors</i>	728